ELLa SE MUEVE SEGURa
mujeres & transporte

A STUDY ON WOMEN'S PERSONAL SECURITY AND PUBLIC TRANSPORT IN THREE LATIN AMERICAN CITIES.

Ella se mueve segura (ESMS) is the result of a study in three Latin American cities on women's concerns about their personal security while using public transport. A multidiscipline team, with the support of the **FIA Foundation** and **CAF**, the Latin American Development Bank, investigated this in **Quito** (Ecuador), **Buenos Aires** (Argentina) and **Santiago** (Chile) using the same methodology.

It is set out in a modular format and it is expected to be a useful reference for a wide audience. This report presents the report's Section 4 - Taking action, with examples and tools that a city planner, transport expert or decision maker can use for addressing gender and urban transport. In addition, an executive summary can be downloaded that has a comprehensive overview of the study and its findings: *https://www.fiafoundation.org/connect/publications/ella-se-mueve-segura-she-moves-safely*.

TAKING ACTION

Currently urban transport is not gender neutral, the planning rarely includes a strong gender dimension, getting this into the planning cycle would help to make transport more gender sensitive and inclusive.

Data and mobility information frequently does not include details on gender, or when it does, it is not (or rarely) included in any diagnostic or analysis that can be used for transport planning or improvements, at city or national levels.

There is little exchange of information and experience between cities or agencies on the challenges, experience or successful measures that address women and public transport at either local, national or regional level, and this is considered to be a knowledge and research gap.

Despite a number of examples and tools available there

is a lack of capacity at national and city level, and the evidence base is still small with research expertise and academic interest patchy.

There is little guidance available for the different clusters of interested parties and the outputs of Ella se Mueve Segura have been used to help develop initial references and proposals.

Globally there is a strong positive correlation between sustainable transport, women's empowerment, their position in society and economic growth. These topics are featuring highly internationally and the combined conclusions from the three cities provide useful insights for cities to take their own steps to address this issue, and for them to provide information to national bodies responsible for monitoring progress on the 2030 agenda.

1. GUIDANCE FOR ACTION

POLICY CLUSTER – PUBLIC PLAYERS

The impetus and support for addressing gender and transport needs to come from the highest office in a city. Women are an important constituency in any city and often make up more than half of the local population, by recognising this the mayor and his/her council sends an important political message about equity and inclusiveness.

It is important to bring together a small but representative group that combines the most committed citizen, political and technical levels to build consensus and work together on developing and applying the best strategy for change.

Setting a base line, based on a diagnostic of the issue within the local context, is considered a good starting point. As set out by the evidence presented from this study, it is vitally

important that women's needs are incorporated into transport networks, and this includes the development of gender action policies. Such as employment policies to engender positive actions towards equal opportunities and encouraging women to apply for jobs within the sector, as well as other policies that help encourage equitable access to transport designed for women as well as other users. The impetus to collect disaggregated data starts at the level of household and transport data survey collection processes and frequency (see previous section on disaggregated data collection by sex, income, mode and trip purpose). Much more can be mined from this data in terms of gender, and the modes that women use most than just origin and destinations.

Starting the process internally within the city administrations

Consulting the heads of urban planning and mobility departments on how they currently include (or do not include) gender into transport and urban mobility planning builds the picture of the current approach to gender and transport at city level. Local experts that can advise on suitable approaches can be brought on board. Typical steps include:

1. Assess whether national support programs or international initiatives can support ambitions and allocate resources to both the strategic and implementation of a Gender Action Plan.
2. Undertake a mapping exercise to plot the main actors and allies.
3. Set the baseline using disaggregated data (initially for origin and destination) that helps to show how women move in your city, overlaid with public transport, cycling and walking routes and information can give a detailed overview.
4. Establish a multi-stakeholder committee with high level steering and chairmanship that owns and develops and/or renews a gender action policy and monitors how the GAAP is progressing.
5. Set clear-cut responsibilities and allocate the necessary resources and mandates within the different unit of the administration.
6. Implement the Gender Action Plan and set in place processes to monitor the implementation of it so it retains its dynamic nature and people pay attention to the issue in all aspects of urban and transport planning.
7. Review the numbers of females in the transport and urban planning departments to ensure that there is also a good gender balance in the internal decision-making processes.
8. Measure the impact of the implemented measures, re-adjust if necessary and update the plan regularly (every 4-7 years).
9. A GAAP can be integrated into a Sustainable Urban Mobility Plan (SUMP).

Data collection

This study has underlined the crucial importance of collecting and analysing data disaggregated by sex (and combining this data with income, mode and trip purpose). There are a number of parameters that need to be more fully looked at, than what is currently the case in order to make transport more gender responsive.

There are a number of tools and technologies that can be used to contain the costs of surveys and data collection, in particular smart phone/android applications available on the Internet that are available free of charge or for a small fee.

PLANNING, INFRASTRUCTURE AND SYSTEM DESIGN – PUBLIC AND PRIVATE PLAYERS

It is difficult to achieve a system that is as attractive to women as to men if the city plans its transport without a thorough understanding of where men and women currently go, but also where they would like to go if transport was available. Typically route planning focus on bringing people closer to jobs and to some extent education, health and sport facilities, but this may not serve women's needs well, as they many women work in the informal sector in the region (especially as domestics).

Mapping Origin and Destination information specifically for women's trips helps to build a picture that can then show where transport provision gaps are and help to plan service delivery that will serve their needs. Female only focus groups also provide good information on this complemented by local audits.

Accessibility mapping can help to provide this informa-

tion, especially if the key interest points are those which are important to women – this might include markets, hospitals and schools rather than main train stations, CBD or centres of employment.

Infrastructure design and route planning can also be seen through a gender lens. When possible, attention should be paid to where bus stops and stations are located in respect to commercial activities using a gender perspective.

Incorporating gender into planning and design

In the planning and design stages, it is extremely important to consult and involve users, particularly women of different ages, diverse socio-cultural, income and other variables into infrastructure and system design. Many tools exist to enable this on a regular basis, such as advisory committees, participatory mapping, field audits etc. A 'tactical urbanism' approach, which allows users to try out and provide feedback on the design of bus stops, buses themselves, and other key components of system infrastructure can really help improve design and user buy-in as well as generate enthusiasm for changes.

Many interventions relate to the concept of Universal Design (also called Inclusive or Accessible Design or just Accessibility) of transport facilities and services that are designed to accommodate the widest range of potential users, including people with mobility and visual impairments (disabilities) and other special needs. 'Universal Access' is growing an interest area, based on a collaborative innovation process in accessibility to transport that takes advantages of all the stakeholders involved in the field: end-users, operators, authorities, designers and manufacturers.

Integrating gender into infrastructure projects and vehicle design

There are a number of ways that gender aspects can be incorporated into large transport projects:

- In the procurement contracts (especially in data collection);
- Improving infrastructure, system design and operational aspects;
- In building capacity at national and local levels with decision makers, transport planners, engineers and
- Motivating the construction industry with quotas and protocols

Key aspects based on the outcomes of our discussions and results of this study in terms of infrastructure to be considered and may be researched in greater depth (depending on the local context) are:

Accessibility

Women travelling with shopping and strollers mirror the same needs as elderly travellers and those in wheelchairs. Therefore, keeping access to grade or limiting the number and height of steps required to access the vehicles and when travelling between modes is important. Footpaths, crossings, sidewalks should be designed with women and children in mind and incorporate design features such as dropped curbs and safety islands at crossings that benefit everyone, but especially women especially when travelling with children. Low floor vehicles and at grade entry is also key.

Sight lines

Ensuring that there are clear sight lines (level of visibility) is probably the second most important design aspect. Women like to be able to easily scan a stop or public space to see that it is safe for her to enter it. In Quito, a number of BRT bus stations have been redesigned and the solid barriers (from ground level to +/- 1.20m) have been replaced by transparent materiel (see example of rehabilitation of BRT bus stations in Quito in the examples).

Lighting

darkness was stated by many our respondents as being a key determinant of when and how they travelled. This included darkness generally but also un/poorly lit areas or

dark spots. Getting the right level of lux at bus stops, in stations and waiting areas is not easy; too high (i.e. too bright) levels can act as a type of spotlight for attracting attention rather than protecting those who are waiting or travelling, while not enough allows (and indeed encourages) people to lurk in dark corners ready to jump on victims.

The placement of lighting poles should not obstruct passageways (especially important at crossings and for women with strollers) and the lights need to be maintained especially in less well-frequented areas of the city.

Tunnels and overpasses

Tunnels and overpasses should be avoided as much as possible as there is substantial evidence that they constitute significant places of risk, for all vulnerable users. If unavoidable, tunnels and overpasses need to be accessible (with escalators or ramps as well as steps) and they should be well lit as they easily suffer from dark spots. Ideally, they should be wide, with no dark corners with well lit and lifts/escalators.

Transport interchanges and hubs

Many trips require a change. Interchanges can themselves act as 'eyes on the street' and can be designed to be dynamic centres with the possibility for small shops, services and occasional authorised market stalls. Linking major interchanges with effective complaints and grievance systems has proved successful (as in Quito and the 'Cuentame' kiosks). These may be combined with other information services, but they should be clearly branded so women, especially, can use them for reporting any type of incident (criminal or other).

Smaller interchanges that may require a short walk should be well designed with good levels of lighting, and no dark areas where men can lurk or congregate so women would feel uncomfortable to pass through. Good passenger information on when the transport is expected is also helpful to reduce anxiety and can allow women (and others) to be able to manage their waiting time better. Convenient washroom/sanitation facilities with well-lit open, safe access should be provided separately for men and women as well as minimum levels of rest areas with seating. All interchanges are suitable for communications campaign outreach.

Wayfinding, signage and passenger information

Women are used to planning their trips more than men, who tend to use habitual schedules, routes and modes. This is due mainly to their care related role as they have to fit in with one or more children's timetables, relatives, shopping and numerous other errands on a daily basis. Therefore, the information on where transit will take them, at what time and how much will it cost, as well as how quickly or easily they can interchange is of higher importance to them. Clear signage and passenger information especially about service change or disruptions are crucial for them to be able to change their plans should they need to.

Design of the vehicles and rolling stock

Should include appropriate standards and functions. 'Barrier free' access is important with as much as possible of the network being fully accessible. Interconnecting carriages for subways and trains allow people to circulate freely. However, this can have both positive and negative aspects as women may board a carriage that she has decided to be 'safe' yet if someone is looking for single or vulnerable women travelling to harass, they can also find her quite easily and it is more difficult for her to change carriages or to 'escape'. The design of buses can include seating areas near the driver for use at night and also the way the bus driver compartment is designed and/or in vehicle cameras may allow him or her to see the corners on the bus where harassment may take place or not.

The width of the passageways, doors and turnstiles also need to be able to be comfortably used by those with pushchairs/baby strollers, young children and shopping. Desig-

nated seating for women who are pregnant, travelling with babies and also the physically less able are welcomed, and clear communication linked with social acceptance helps make it 'normal' that these seats are used properly. Suggestions for designating an area near the bus driver, for women to use at night was also a suggestion from the study findings.

Grab rails and handles

Can be quite tricky for women to use if they are designed for male rather than females. On the one hand, women are generally physically smaller than men, so the positioning of the rails must allow women to easily grab them and secondly, they should avoid putting women's body into positions that are uncomfortable for them or inappropriate, i.e. encouraging groping or harassment especially when there is overcrowding. As driver behaviour is a concern especially for women and the elderly.

Falling and being thrown about was mentioned in the focus groups as being a problem (mentioned in all three cities) and is often the main cause for the elderly to be hurt. As women frequently travel with shopping and/or children/strollers they are also more at risk from stop/start driving, therefore having the appropriate handles and grab rails available and specified in vehicle design is also an important gender aspect.

Transport operational design

There are several operational aspects that can be improved and which, if put into mainstream practice, would make transport more gender sensitive. This can be seen from different perspectives: including how transport is organised, scheduled and operated as well as increasing the numbers of women active in the sector and how front-line, operational staff interact with women and how gender sensitive they are encouraged and /or trained to be.

Fare integration and affordability

Women are typically poorer than men are, and usually have less to spend on their transport needs. Low-income women, in particular, suffer most if they have to pay each public transport trip individually when they trip chain. They also tend to be more vulnerable to extortion (with drivers and/or crews illegally increasing prices because they are women or are travelling with children or shopping/market produce) on the many legs of their trip chain. Thus, it also goes without saying that integrated ticketing with seamless changes provides particular advantages to them, as long as the system is not designed in such a way as to exclude them (for example requirements for 'high' upfront payment to be put onto a smart card). Being careful with the amount spent on transport, is frequently the reason that many poor women walk – for at least for some part(s) of their journey.

Grievance systems

In this study, it was found that there was significant under reporting of events for a number of reasons. This was because women in all three cities stated high levels of harassment, but this was not reflected in complaint statistics.

It is important that people (passengers, employees and the general public) know:

· What behaviour is unacceptable;
· When to intervene to help others if you are aware of something suspicious happening;
· How to stop incidents and how to intervene if you witness them and what to do;
· How to report such incidents.

It goes without saying that women will feel further intimidated if they have to explain sensitive sexual details of an attack to a male security agent, so female staffing will be needed (if it is not already in place). Specific protocols on how to respond to the different situations that can arise and training in their contents and application is crucial.

Where the complaints need to be made and how convenient (easy to access) are key to these services being

used, and the easy availability of assistance will increase the number of reports. Indeed, increasing the numbers of reports should be an objective of the city – rather than decreasing them, as this will increase the visibility of this issue. It will also help to redress the current situation that many women do not think to report such incidents and many women are harassed because men do not think that they will be caught.

The security agents responsible for the transport spaces that are used by passengers should also be involved in developing the program and protocols. Gender sensitive training for drivers, front line staff and security agents, and in some cases, the creation of gender units within these groups can help to ensure that complaints are treated quickly, efficiently and sensitively. Although in most cases, the units can be integrated as subsection within existing bodies. As indicated strongly in this study, women mistrust the effectiveness of authorities dealing with harassment.

Technology

There has significant progress in how technology can help security. The most obvious and used intervention is the CCTV cameras. These are most often used on rail-based systems (train and subway) and at major stations and interchanges. However, increasingly they are being installed in-vehicle (e.g. bus) to protect not only passengers but also aggressions against the drivers and/or conductors. They can also be used for surveillance of outlying stations and stops, and they do act as a deterrent.

However, there are limitations: these include high costs of capital investment and installation, continued maintenance, quality of footage and the human staffing at control centres. They have other shortcomings apart from high costs as in crowded (and overcrowded) areas they may not be able to pick up harassment (rather than aggression). In addition, as technology is developing it is important to consider how it can be upgraded to avoid premature obsolescence. A combination of human presence and technical

surveillance is often the most effective solution – and this depends on the context and resources available.

Technology, however, has many uses. It can now be used for collecting any types or data, as well as mapping and auditing. There are a number of applications such as SafetiPin, which are in use. Data can also be collected using smart phones (and technology partnerships) providing an affordable option for route mapping, alighting and boarding information, vehicle frequency and crowding levels.

However as shown in the study, personal security is of greater concern with low income women – and currently despite lower costs the penetration of smart phones is not yet widespread enough for this to be a secure way to help protect women. This was one of the main reasons for the 'Bájale al Acoso' pilot program to use an SMS rather than an application in Quito.

Photo: A unique SMS number can be used to send a direct message to a complaints centre in Quito with the Bajale al Acoso campaign that has been trialled and is now being rolled out in 2000 buses. Photo credit ESMS.

_____

Getting more women working in the sector

Transport jobs can be well paid, rewarding and offer long-term career opportunities for men and women, but attracting women to join the sector is still a challenge. Nonetheless, there are many opportunities for women to work transport. A higher representation and integration of women into the sector will ultimately help to bring the benefits of diversity to a typically male dominated work

force. In places where this has been successful, it has been recognised as a win-win-win situation. The differing perspectives and approaches to work of women and men can complement each other and everyone benefits – management, worker and customer.

Typically, the barriers are:

- Recruitment – if women do not feature in the job advertisement or fit easily into the job profile (the wording may not be correct to attract them to apply), then women will not apply or think that they are qualified for the job, although they may be.
- Women more frequently feel that they do not have the right skills and/or qualifications for jobs in transport and may require extra encouragement. If quotas are introduced into contracts, more efforts will be made by operators to find suitable women. In addition, over and above complying with legal requirements for equal opportunities, internal protocols are often required to ensure that women and men have the same opportunities for training and career advancements.
- Working time, as work timetables and shifts may not allow women the flexibility they need in order to reconcile work and family/social life: work organisation such as fitting in with school holidays and avoiding night shifts are helpful in this respect.
- A lack of suitable facilities such as rest facilities, dedicated changing rooms and bathroom facilities.
- Health and safety aspect of the workplace cannot be neglected. Uniform design is an obvious aspect that needs to be considered, as well as segregated facilities and rest/changing areas, as well as, (ideally) child care facilities are in some cases necessary or desirable, and this also helps single fathers or fathers that are having to assume more of the family caring roles, due to choose or personal circumstances.
- Wages, career progression and re-entering the market, and training opportunities

- Workplace discrimination and violence is still widespread (see ILO publication 'No place for women') and this is a major barrier to attracting women into the sector. The continual reinforcement of this message, and visible support from senior management, helps to provide the confidence for women to report workplace incidents, but also helps staff who may have witnessed incidents and have to cope with distressed passengers to know what to do and to provide immediate and effective support to victims.

Protocols and staff guidance

The role of the operational staff (both male and female) towards the customer is also seen as being crucial. Clear guidance and protocols for front line staff (and passengers) to follow are seen as being crucial. How staff are expected to behave and to react to women's needs should be widely advertised both on the system where passengers will see it as well as in the back-office area where staff, drivers and other employees will see it on a constant basis. Regular training sessions linked to an approved organization equality and zero tolerance policy for the poor treatment of women is an important component.

Other protocols that have proved useful include operational aspects allowing public transport operators to implement certain actions that help protect women, such as the 'between bus stop request'. This started in Montreal in 1996 and has been successfully introduced in a number of systems worldwide.

Training of front line transport staff and police on prevention, protocols on how to respond to sexual harassment and how to address complaints are also considered extremely important elements for success.

In all the three cities, it was clear that there is a low level of trust in the capacity and effectiveness of the authorities to bring perpetrators to justice. Strong public awareness campaigns help to redress this and build trust. These can use a variety of mediums such as traditional communication channels (press, TV and radio), public service announcements, social media (Facebook, Twitter and local versions of these) and identifying local or national champions who can increase the visibility of the issue and its non-acceptance.

The role of communications is crucial to set clear boundaries on what can be and should be reported, as these will vary depending on social and cultural norms. Multi-stakeholder consultations need to be held in order to help structure these – that include a wide variety of differing profiles and perspectives.

THE ROLE OF CIVIL SOCIETY IN MAKING PUBLIC TRANSPORT MORE SECURE

Building strong alliances with citizens and civil society and local and national ministries of transport, education, health, employment with the objective of engaging on planning, financing and operations of local transport is the way forward. Encouragement from local government, institutions, NGOs, Women's organizations, Academia and Research institutions creates a 'win-win' situation.

Civil society has a major role to play in:

· Making sure the voices of women are heard in the decision-making about transport
· Mobilising women's groups and others to ensure that they engage with the authorities on improving transport in a positive fashion
· Women take an interest in the transport options that are currently on offer, are able to make suggestions about improvements and that they invest in increasing their knowledge about what is possible, feasible and just.

Through collaboration and partnerships, Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) play a powerful role in building credibility and improving the effectiveness of monitoring systems. Examples from other places include London Travel Watch, an arms-length citizen-controlled institution funded by the London Assembly, which processes complaints regarding the transport system with an autonomy and transparency absent when agencies manage their own complaints.

Similarly, public transport agencies can integrate citizen representatives, who offer diverse and valuable skills as well as a citizens' perspective on key planning and strategic decisions. In North America, many transit agencies have advisory councils with citizen representation. The Toronto Transit Corporation (Canada) is run by a board that includes elected city councillors and city-council appointed citizen representatives. Similarly, a citizen coalition, the Toronto Centre for Active Transport is leading the implementation of complete streets in 19 Ontario municipalities, large and small.

An added benefit is the discussions such alliances create between players, who often have not been able to discuss these issues previously, thus integrating diverse perspectives into a single analysis. This is useful not only to address security and harassment issues here, but also to generate on-going dialogue among local/regional authorities, organized citizens and others to find common solutions based on the resources and knowledge of all those present.

The following section documents examples from the three core cities. In the second part of this section presents further examples that are thought to be of interest to those using the toolkit and a selection of useful tools are in the third part.

BUENOS AIRES, ARGENTINA

Awareness raising campaigns:

Eso que no vemos también es violencia de género (2016) and "#PARALAMANO", (2015)

The public railway company Trenes Argentinos (SOFSE), developed two awareness campaigns, with posters, information booths and delivery of brochures in railway stations with significant demand flow. One of them was developed in 2015 and updated during 2016; the other took place at the beginning of 2017. The first one was called "#PARALAMANO" and the second one "FOR A TRIP FREE OF VIOLENCE".

In 2016, the City government of Buenos Aires with the National Ministry of Human Development and Habitat developed an awareness campaign about all types of gender violence, covering from the most explicit to more implicit examples, such as humiliation, devaluation, contempt and/or emotional blackmail. The campaign was called "What we do not see is also gender violence" (Eso que no vemos también es violencia de género) and included posters on the subway and public roads.

Photo: An example from Buenos Aires city's campaign What we do not see is also gender violence" (Eso que no vemos también es violencia de género), Buenos Aires, 2016

Since 2016, the public metro company SBASE (which depends on the Government of the City of Buenos Aires) and is responsible for the administration and control of the subway operation implements a survey to collect information and opinions from passenger on a regular basis. The objective is to better understand the numbers of situations of aggression experienced by the subway users.

Data availability

The Ministry of Transportation (national) has a website (http://uecmovilidad.gob.ar/category/publicaciones/encuestas/) where reports and household mobility surveys databases carried out both in AMBA and in several metropolitan areas of Argentina can be accessed. The surveys, conducted between 2008 and 2013, have variables that distinguish by gender the members of the households that made up the sample.

Targets for women employed in the transport sector

By taking a pro-active approach and dedicated recruitment criteria, the government of the City of Buenos Aires has been able to increase the gender balance in the numbers of city traffic agents to an equal representation of women and men. Currently, of the 2,750 agents, 54% (1,485 agents) are women. During the month of July 2017, from 303 new agents recruited, 66% were women.

Other examples within AMBA include efforts to incorporate more women as drivers of urban buses. Since 1998, the operating company "Grupo Plaza" has systematically encouraged women to become bus drivers the only company in the agglomerate that hires women as drivers. Starting in 2010 with 1% (22 drivers) of the total number of 2,000 drivers, it peaked at 40 but has since reduced to 15 in 2015. In 2011, the Municipality of Vicente López, located in the northern area of Greater Buenos Aires, put a free local bus line in place (Transporte Bicentenario), whose drivers are all women. The service is provided within the limits of Vicente López's municipality and particularly reaches kindergardens, maternal centres and recreational centres for the Elderly, in the routes covered. Currently the line has eight units and a staff of 18, between women drivers and guards. It is striking that in AMBA has only two initiatives that could be identified. Some transport operators maintain that adding women as drivers would require adapting existing infrastructure in the companies (changing rooms, bathrooms, etc.), until now, only suitable for male drivers. Based on the low level of spontaneous reaction by women to step forward as drivers, they do not consider it necessary to implement these changes in the facilities, which requires specific investments.

Rail actions

The public railway company Trenes Argentinos (SOFSE), responsible for the operation of 5 of the 7 urban passenger lines in AMBA, and several regional lines, has developed an institutional "Plan for Gender Equality". It aims at generating both internal actions within the company itself (such as gender training and awareness of human resources) and actions with public aimed at improving the experience travel of the users of their service. Agreements were signed with the National Institute for Women (INAM) and the National Institute against Discrimination, Xenophobia and Racism (INADI).

Two awareness campaigns, with posters, information booths and the delivery of brochures in railway stations with significant demand flow were implemented. One of them was developed in 2015 and updated during 2016; the other took place at the beginning of 2017. The first one was called "" #PARALAMANO" and the second one "FOR A TRIP FREE OF VIOLENCE".

In line with their implementation of the Gender Equality Plan, SOFSE carried out a survey in 2017, to make a diagnosis on gender violence in the metropolitan train system. In addition, it is noted that the rail union currently bans the employment of women as train drivers while this is not the case on the Buenos Aires subway. In 2016, of 532 metro drivers of the subway and the light rail (Premetro), 427 were men and 105 women (representing 20%). Out of the 433 guards: 289 were men and 144 women (33%).

Metrobus

Metrobus is one of the most emblematic recent transport measures implemented in AMBA. A system combines pre-existing urban buses with segregated infrastructure to increase bus reliability and promote the use of public transport. The system has been expanded and currently the Metrobus is now a major part of the network, connecting the city centre with the rest of the metropolitan area.

Its objective is to reduce travel time, increasing predictability and contribute to better road safety. It also implies an improvement in the quality of the public space, which includes the renovation of urban space in the area, the revaluation of sidewalks and the improvement of lighting. In general, Metrobus has been positively received by the users, with travel time gains being the most valued benefit. According to the latest report on the results of the Survey of Users of Metrobus Juan B. Justo (CNRT, 2016), the aspects perceived with a high positive rating are: the behaviour of drivers and the timesavings.

Safer cycling infrastructure

Since 2009, the City of Buenos Aires (CABA) has been segregating its cycling infrastructure, so cyclists can cycle in relative safety out of traffic. In 2017, the cycle path network reached 180 kilometres.

Since 2010, the free public bicycle system has been operating in the central area encouraging the general use of this mode of sustainable transport. According to information from the GCBA, the number of trips made by women on bicycles in the city has increased: from 7.2% in 2009 to 21.4% in 2016. However, when observing the level of enrolment in the public bicycle system, although 4 out of 10 registered in 2016 were women, they represent only a third of those who actually use the system.

In this sense, civil society organizations play an active role in promoting equal participation in the road space, especially including women and in relation to the use of the bicycle. Since 2011 the Association of Urban Cyclists (ACU), together with Ciclofamilia, provide training courses in the use of bicycles for adults, of which currently about 75% are women, through the Bicycle School ("Biciescuela"). Among them, half are between 20 and 30 years old. One of the members of these organizations mentions that their actions are always "motivated by equality" because they observed from those who join the Bicycle School, that "there is a whole group of people who are out of urban cycling (...) and we are mobilized by the situation of social [and] gender inequality."

Prevention of violence and women's activism

The City of Buenos Aires (CABA) has legislation in place for the "Prevention of sexual harassment in public spaces or public access" (Law 5742 – 2016), which seeks to prevent and punish those that harass (verbal or physical), mistreat or intimidate or affect the general the dignity, freedom, free movement and the right to the physical or moral integrity of people, based on their condition of gender, identity and / or sexual orientation. The Law also stipulates actions and dissemination campaigns to make visible, denaturalize and eradicate this type of violence. Thus, in the CABA, street harassment is by law considered a contravention and penalties included monetary sanctions or public utility actions.

Women's organizations, among them MuMaLá (Mujeres de la Matria Latinoamericana), have collaborated to increase the visibility of street harassment that the women of the City of Buenos Aires and other cities of Argentina suffer daily. This important contribution made from civil society includes surveys, reports of results and helps to demonstrate the need to research women's experiences of violence in urban space.

Lack of proper procedures for complaints and grievances leading to reinforcing national and local institutions

This was found in the study to be is one of the greatest weaknesses in addressing harassment and violence. Buenos Aires was no different and the lack of information and mechanisms to carry out effective reporting, has weakened the relatively strong legal framework in place to protect women from all types of violence. Some initiatives to complement the Law 5742, and the creation of the Argentinian Observatory Against Harassment (OCA), with the responsibility to gather information and statistics about the different forms of harassment, are helping to increase the number of reported incidents. In addition, the Office of the Ombudsman of the City of Buenos Aires has created the Observatory of Gender Equality, with the objective to monitor and influence public policies in the city.

Since 2010, the Province of Buenos Aires has had an Observatory on Gender Violence. the Law 26,485 on "Integral Protection to prevent, punish and eradicate violence against women in the areas where they develop their interpersonal activities", gave the National Council of Women (CNM), (a body created in 1992) the mandate to be the governing entity in charge of articulating and coordinating actions to ensure compliance with this law. In addition, it works on

the design of public policies that allow the implementation of its provisions.

During 2017, the CNM developed the first "National Plan of Action to promote the Prevention, Assistance and Eradication of Violence against Women 2017–2019", a national legal requirement. It consists of a strategic planning tool that gathers and systematizes policies, programs and initiatives. In September 2017, the "National Institute for Women (INAM)", created by Decree 698, became a decentralized entity of the Ministry of Social Development, at the national level, to continue the tasks of the CNM. This hierarchy of the agency, as Secretary of State, seeks to accelerate the administrative time currently required to implement the programs.

QUITO

Over the past ten years, Quito has implemented a number of campaigns. In 2011 "I want to travel safely, free from harassment" (Quiero caminar tranquila y sin acoso), was the first to target public transport, the Bus Rapid Transit system known as Trolebus.

Changing the legal framework

The local ordinance #235, championed by a young city councillor, Norman Wray, was approved in 2012. The objective of this ordinance is to eradicate gender-based violence inside homes (domestic violence) but also within public space. It contains concepts such as including gender mainstreaming into projects, actions and campaigns and training public servants, metropolitan police and national police on this issue. Different kinds of harassment: physical, sexual and psychological violence, and street harassment or street-sexual abuse are specially recognized for the first time. Finally, this ground breaking local ordinance created the basis for other protocols in the mobility sector designed to tackle harassment in public transport.

An extract from Quito's ordinance 0235, approved in 2012
_____

LA ERRADICACIÓN DE LA VIOLENCIA BASADA EN GÉNERO EN EL DISTRITO METROPOLITANO DE QUITO

Artículo 1.- Agréguese después del Capítulo Innumerado *"Protección Integral de los niños y adolescentes contra la explotación sexual en el Distrito Metropolitano de Quito"*, del Título II, Libro Primero del Código Municipal para el Distrito Metropolitano de Quito, agregado por la Ordenanza Metropolitana No. 246, sancionada el 7 de febrero de 2008, el siguiente Capítulo Innumerado "De las políticas hacia la erradicación de la violencia basada en género en el Distrito Metropolitano de Quito", al tenor del siguiente texto:

"Capítulo...
De las políticas hacia la erradicación de la violencia basada en género en el Distrito Metropolitano de Quito

In parallel to this ordinance, there were many communications efforts and campaigns. For example, during 2011 the campaign "I want to walk safely, streets without harassment" was implemented. This campaign was directed at men and had a widespread impact because it was the first in its kind to address this issue to men, as the main audience.

Public awareness campaigns: Cuéntame

In 2014, Cuéntame booths were introduced with the following new municipal administration, and under the lead of the former Vice-Mayor Daniela Chacón. The campaign "Cuéntame" (Tell me) was an integral approach to tackle insecurity and to facilitate the process of reporting to authorities. Harassment has reached epic proportions and after declaring the Municipal Transportation System in emergency, an Emergency Plan was created. This included measures and a budget to face sexual harassment on public transport and implementation of Cuéntame booths, in major passenger transfer (interchange) stations for women to be able to get support or report sexual harassment on public transport. In the kiosk, women could choose to report violence to trained staff and to file a complaint against the perpetrator or just to receive immediate attention and guidance on what to do next. Drivers for the Quito transport system have been trained to help those affected and to provide information on how and where to report incidents of VAWG .

This project also provides legal and psychological support to the victim and follows specific judicial protocols. In just nine months, the booths had received 274 complaints, of which two sentences were generated, the first of its kind in the judicial system of the city. While in operation, the system led to 11 people charged for serious incidents, with two convictions for underage molestation.

In addition, since May 2015, the campaign Yo Cambio por Ellas was organized by the Patronato San José, in order to sensitize the 200,000 passengers of the Trolebús system about this issue. The objective is to promote reflection, especially of men, on the discomfort that women feel in public transport when harassed.

As part of the actions implemented, 3,500 officials and municipal employees or collaborators of the EPMTPQ, the Metropolitan Transit Agency, the Metropolitan Police and the Public Works Enterprise, have been trained in themes such as new masculinities, protocols of attention and human rights.

Bájale al acoso

In 2017, the project Cuéntame was redesigned to increase the coverage and to facilitate the process of reporting with a new concept called "Bájale al Acoso" (Down with harassment in) was introduced. This has helped to reduce the number of sexual harassment incidents and denunciations still occurring on the public transportation system since the cabins were implemented.

The objective of this campaign is to rely less on the judicial system and generate a social sanction at the point where harassment occurs, by using a technology platform that provides information in real time. Since users of the public transport usually do not have time to put a complaint in the cabins during the trips, Down with Harassment was implemented so that the victim can put an instant report by sending an SMS. An SMS was chosen as not all women have access to smart phones or data roaming (especially low-income women).

Once the message is received, the person receives a call from the control centre of the EPMTPQ asking for the situation; simultaneously the driver is notified of the incident of harassment and an alarm sounds inside the bus unit, alerting all passengers that they should be especially vigilant. In addition, the police or security personnel of the EPMTPQ are made available in order to intercept the victim and / or aggressor at the next bus station. The victim is given the opportunity to legally report the situation, but the main objective is to reduce cases alerting citizens. This was designed as from research more than 61% of women, who experience sexual harassment on the buses, did not received any protection or support from other passengers.

According to information sent from Patronato San José, the system "Bájale el acoso" has received 1,011 SMS messages in the period from March to December 2017, leading to 32 cases being brought to trial and from these cases, there has been 6 judgements (of between 12 to 36 months to prison). Additionally, more than 4,000 people has been sensitized and trained (Metropolitan police, private security and drivers) as part of the program. This trial will be further rolled out onto 2,000 buses across the system (January 2018).

Research into criminal behaviour shows that the decision to offend is highly influenced by the cues given and the perceived risk of being caught. If perpetrators feel that they are more likely to be caught, it is likely that they will refrain from the temptation to harass women. Such measures can be evaluated to see the extent that they reduce the temptation to offend, and if this is a cost effective or overly costly measure to implement.

Bus stops rehabilitation

In 2016, a number of "Trolebús" system bus stops were redesigned to make them more gender sensitive. This included replacing a steel lower panel with a glass-walled design that guarantees better interior and exterior visibility as a mechanism to promote passenger safety. This new infra-

structure was put in place to complement new high capacity, bi-articulated buses bought by the municipality, being put into operation.

The cost of this project was some USD 13 million and 44 bus stops have been upgraded. This new infrastructure is branded with messages of different campaigns to stop harassment and includes universal accessibility for disable people making easier to Access for women.

Use of Social media

The Quito team also used social media to promote the study during the period of investigation. The use social media is a growing way of successfully communicating on this issue.

An Ella Se Mueve Segura Facebook page was created for the Quito international seminar and continued for the rest of the study. It quickly attained 500 followers with 2,870 likes. The followers came from well beyond Latin America and included the following countries Argentina, Austria, Australia, Belgium, Bolivia, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Germany, Honduras, Ecuador, France, Spain and Venezuela.

SANTIAGO

Promoting bus driving as a suitable job for women

Faced with prejudices against women drivers and the fact that several private operators refused to hire women bus drivers, the Transantiago public transport agency developed an awards program. The public are able to vote for the Best Male and Best Female Bus Drivers. This award was designed to recognise women bus drivers and to complement the award already given to men.

Within a year, all bus companies had a small, but growing contingent of women bus drivers, so that they could compete for the award, which is important for their rather low public image. This also became an opportunity to highlight women's role and contributions to the quality of public transport before the general public. This award also provides an opportunity for the public to see that women may also apply, and succeed, to become bus drivers as well as recognizing those that are working in the system. The winner may also visit and give talks in local schools to help break down barriers about the sort of jobs that women are able to do.

Their increased involvement is also particularly strategic as there is currently a shortage of qualified drivers in Santiago, and public transport operators must compete with large mining companies for suitable professionals in this area.

Cycle inclusion and increasing the numbers of women cycling

The city of Santiago has enjoyed considerable success with a focus on 'cycle inclusion' that has been developed during three years of training and collaborative policy implementation by citizen organizations, local and regional governments and some private players (2007 – 2010). A survey conducted by the Ministry of Transport and Telecommunications in Santiago found that there was a very low number of women cyclists in the city. Women either did not know how to ride or were afraid to use it in the city.

With assistance from international and local experts, a Santiago women's group, Living City and Macleta, set up courses to encourage women to ride bicycles as a mode of empowerment. They introduced the "Learn to pedal" course for complete beginners, and the "Get off the sidewalk" initiative aimed at women who knew how to ride a bicycle but were too frightened to use it around the city.

Cycle facilities quadrupled from 50km to over 200km between 2007 and 2012, as the city government invested in an extensive network of cycle tracks. Modal share has doubled to 4%, women's participation grew from under 10% to around 30%.

Some 40,000 people can be seen cycling, walking and roller-skating on the streets of Santiago every Sunday, as part of the open streets CicloRecreoVía initiative, which closes a zone of city streets to vehicular traffic to make them available for walking, running, cycling and other social activities.

Safety and security audits

The method of women's safety audits, developed by ME-TREC (Toronto) and adopted by UN Habitat for use in cities in the developing world, was adapted and tested in the El Bosque district of Santiago. This was combined with a participatory mapping exercise, which provided considerable data on specific micro-level problems requiring social, design or policing solutions. Participatory safety audits are a tool for exploring the elements of public spaces that can undermine or improve feelings of safety and vulnerability. They can also generate public awareness and important consensuses around specific actions to improve insecurity issues.

Public awareness communication campaigns

In 2017, Santiago's Metro developed a poster campaign with a citizens' organization, the Observatory against harassment of women in public spaces (OCAC). This underlined that "Harassment is violence" (#Acoso es violencia). Two masculine focused civil society groups, EME Masculinidades and MenEngage Alliance, cooperated with a complementary campaign: Aren't you ashamed? (#no te da vergüenza).

3. GOOD EXAMPLES OF TOOLS

APPLICATIONS

There are a number of Android™ phone applications that have been developed both for the user and to help authorities to pin point where harassment is happening most. The list below outlines a number that can be accessed on the internet:

SafetiPin

SafetiPin is a Delhi based social enterprise providing a number of technology solutions to make cities safer for women and others. The app MySafetiPin and SafetiPin Nite can be used to collect information in the form of a Safety Audit based on 9 key parameters: level of lighting, openness (sight lines), visibility, transport facilities and modes available, security (such as presence of security agents or help kiosks), state of the walking infrastructure, feeling (emotional sentiment of the area – does it feel safe or unsafe).

Anyone can download the app and use it to make audits to indicate safe areas in their city. They can report problems such as poor/no lighting, broken/blocked footpath, etc. While travelling, they can view Safety Audits to view safe and unsafe locations and plan their routes accordingly. It has been used in India, Colombia (Bogotá), the Philippines, Indonesia, Kenya and Papua New Guinea.

SafetiPin Nite collect images from the perspective of a moving vehicle such as a taxi. SafetiPin has been working with governments, NGOs, city planners, international agencies and corporates, to provide safety data for change and has been tested in a number of cities.

SafetiPin Track allows more personalised information and rules can be set on to let friends know only if something unusual happens. Web site: *http://safetipin.com*

Safecity, India

Safecity, India is registered as not for profit foundation, the website is a platform that crowdsources personal stories of sexual harassment and abuse in public spaces. This anonymous data is aggregated into hot spots on a map indicating trends at a local level. The idea is to make this data useful for individuals, local communities and local administration to identify factors that causes behaviour that leads to violence and work on strategies for solutions.

Since its launch on 26 Dec 2012, over 10,000 stories from over 50 cities in India, Kenya, Cameroon and Nepal have been collected. Web site: *http://safecity.in/*

Harassmap

HarassMap has been used in Egypt to collect information on offences that take place in public spaces, including on or around transport recently celebrated its five years of existence. Via a website victims are encouraged to anonymously document incidents on-line and the data is then complied to give the authorities and the public of hot spots which could be avoided or better patrolled. People's stories are published on social media so there is a better understanding of the types of incidents occurring and the victims are offered legal, medical and physiological support. In its first year, the HarassMap (2012) web site had 88,851 visits and 239,821 page views.

Hollaback

Hollaback started in 2005 as a blog in the United States. It has now grown into an international internet platform for addressing harassment in public spaces with more than 30 countries and many more local chapters. It builds on the simple concept that the Internet is actually the largest global public space and it can be used to build a community who feel empowered to address this issue. They have identified that the real motive of harassment is intimidation – and making a target scared or uncomfortable helps to make the harasser feel powerful.

By documenting, mapping and sharing incidents of harassment this power is shifted to the victim rather than the perpetrator. 'Street' or harassment in public places frequently requires the victim to remain silent in order not to escalate the unwanted behaviour. Hollaback allows the victims to become more confident and to take control as they have a course of redress. HeartMob is their first online platform to tackle harassment by providing real-time support to individuals experiencing harassment and gives bystanders indications of concrete actions so they can take to step in and help with confidence. Users who report harassment have the option of keeping their report private and cataloguing it in case it escalates, or they can make the report public. If they choose to make it public, they can choose how they want bystanders to support them, take action, or intervene.

DESIGNING URBAN SPACES FOR WOMEN

There are a number of design systems and principles that can be helpful in determining what can be done to design public space to be more gender sensitive. There are a number of quite well know tools such as Universal design, Complete streets, Urban principles (such as those developed by Gehl ITDP and GIZ) which can be found on the internet. Gehl Architects have also produced a number of useful reports. Some less well-known but nonetheless useful tools are mentioned below.

CPTED – Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design

CPTED is an internationally recognised approach with four main principles that form part of their security assessment:

Principle #1 Natural Surveillance

"See and be seen" is the overall goal when it comes to CPTED and natural surveillance. A person is less likely to commit a crime if they think someone will see them do it. Lighting and landscape play an important role in Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design

Principle #2 – Natural Access Control

Natural Access Control is more than a high block wall topped with barbed wire. Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design or CPTED utilizes the use of walkways, fences, lighting, signage and landscape to clearly guide people and vehicles to and from the proper entrances. The goal with this CPTED principle is not necessarily to keep intruders out, but to direct the flow of people while decreasing the opportunity for crime.

Principle #3 – Territorial Reinforcement

Creating or extending a "sphere of influence" by utilizing physical designs such as pavement treatments, landscaping and signage that enable users of an area to develop a sense of proprietorship over it is the goal of this CPTED principle. Public areas are clearly distinguished from private ones. Potential trespassers perceive this control and are thereby discouraged.

Principle #4 Maintenance

CPTED and the "Broken Window Theory" suggests that one "broken window" or nuisance, if allowed to exist, will lead to others and ultimately to the decline of an entire neighbourhood. Neglected and poorly maintained properties are breeding grounds for criminal activity. Developing a formal CPTED based maintenance plan helps preserve property and make it a safer place.

CPTED has been successfully applied in Villa Padre Hurtado, a social housing settlement in Puente Alto, a North East part of Santiago Chile – an area that is very dangerous and with high levels of drug trafficking. http://www.cpted-security.com/cpted_design_guidelines.htm

Collectiu Punt 6

A Barcelona based group of feminist planners, architects and activists interested in rethinking cities, neighborhoods and the built environment in order to eliminate discrimination and include a gender perspective in local planning. The group started working in response to a new law approved in 2004 in Catalonia, the Neighborhood Law, which mandated cities to promote gender equity in the use of public space and facilities. The main activities of Punt 6 since then have been: research, participatory processes, training and capacity building, women's activism and advocacy, consultancy projects and co-development. The group have worked with gender audits, equity plans and training on gender violence prevention with diverse audiences in El Salvador, Mexico, the United States and Spain. *http://www.punt6.org/en/*

4. CONCLUSIONS

The issue of female security on public transport is a complex one, and there is no one cause to which a solution can be found, which when applied will overcome this issue in all situations. In order to answer who takes action, one needs to be able to answer a number of questions such as: Whose problem is it? Who is responsible, and who is not? Is this a human rights issue, a security or a transport operational issue? To what extent does this reflect the current attitudes to gender relations and violence, which is manifested in people's behaviour in public space and on public transport?

Our research suggests that diverse actors working together with their needs and strengths can provide successful solutions and effective responses. Typically, a number of solutions may have to foster a combination of top-down (legislation, policies, reinforced or reviewed justice procedures and security interventions, improved infrastructure), bottom-up (citizens' demands, pressure, networks and local actions) and middle-out (collaborative structures, operational actions) solutions and actions. Together they can generate and identify locally appropriate and effective solutions. By combining resources and strategically applying solutions by a variety of players, changes in people's behaviour can be achieved. The ESMS TOOLKIT provides more details and guidance for how the different urban and regional players transport operators, academics and civil society can play roles in co-creating solutions and measures.

Typical solutions from different sources based on the results of the surveys, the focus groups, inputs from the advisory councils and our interviews with city authorities, transport experts, academics, citizens and women's groups and public transport passengers themselves are put forward here. These are organized into policy, operational and communication –based clusters.

In all cities, the results underlined the importance of

- Organizing public awareness (advertising and information) campaigns with hot lines (to support centers);
- Visibly improving security (human presence and technology with CCTV cameras);
- Improving how incidents are reported and processed, and better defining what can and should be reported, so all types of serious harassment, and not only criminal offences, are reported;
- Providing better support and grievance systems (especially trained staff with security agencies but also bus drivers, station managers and other frontline responders) so staff are confident of what to do when situations arise, panic buttons and integrated security systems on buses (as Metro and train systems often have);
- Increasing levels of punishment and generating an environment of zero tolerance (this may also require local ordinances, reviewing legal frameworks to include public transport as part of public space and specifying what types of harassment is included;
- Making operational changes such as allowing buses to stop on request at night and bike-bus combinations to reduce waiting at feeder route stops;
- Improving infrastructure and maintenance especially at outlying and less frequently areas (including good lighting at stops, stations, tunnels and waiting areas, keeping sight lines clear to reduce closed spaces and seating and the removal of graffiti)

Most importantly, including men and boys in such studies is seen as crucial to better understand and identify the root causes of this type of gender based harassment and violence.

5. ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS